

Meta Analysis: Song as a Tool to Improve Students' Vocabulary Mastery

Olivia Khoirin Nisa'¹, Umi Nikmatus Sa'adah², Ida Vera Sophya³, Sri Wahyuningsih⁴

^{1,2,3,4} English Education Department, IAIN Kudus, Indonesia

Contact:	Olivia Khoirin Nisa'		khairinnisaolivia@gmail.com
	Umi Nikmatus Sa'adah		umiporselin17@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

A song can be used as a medium to improve vocabulary in English teaching. The objective of this research is to analyze the evidence on the efficacy of song as a tool to improve student's vocabulary mastery. Method: The articles about the song as a medium of English teaching were systematically searched over the past 5 years. Meta-analyses were performed to pool standardized mean differences (SMD). Results: 10 articles were included in the systematic review, and only 4 articles meta-analyzed. SMD in mastering vocabulary by using songs at pre-test was 57,79 and post-test was 86,5 Conclusion: A song can be effective in initially improving students' vocabulary mastery.

KEYWORDS:

English song; tool;
Vocabulary

Introduction

In Indonesia, English is a foreign language taught to students in schools. It is taught from elementary school to college (Bawawa, 2020). It can be known that in modern times the role of English is very important in life. Speaking in the English language is certainly related to vocabulary. Sometimes, students are afraid to speak English because of their lack of vocabulary. Teaching vocabulary can be said to be difficult for students and teachers in the process of learning English because it requires effort from both parties so that it can be understood by students well (Sari, et al., 2019).

Vocabulary is the main key in learning English as a basis for forming sentences and can express intentions and thoughts in communicating (Bai, 2018). In order for students to master English, it is necessary to master a lot of vocabulary. However, in everyday applications, students often encounter unfamiliar vocabulary due to a lack of vocabulary mastery. Without understanding enough vocabulary, they will not understand their own ideas or those of others. Most people like the activity of listening to and singing songs. This is because a person can express their feelings and emotions when happy, sad, or bored. Therefore, by the time someone listens to music, it will be more comfortable and happy. Songs can be applied by students outside or inside the classroom. That way, students will be trained to learn new vocabulary.

Various media can be used in Learning English vocabulary to support teachers in teaching and developing vocabulary, one of which is a song. A song is an interesting teaching tool in learning new vocabulary to students who can introduce the vocabulary meaning of music lyrics (Mantika, 2021). All these media can be used according to the character of the students they face. In this study, researchers focused more on the medium of songs as a tool to improve students' vocabulary. Because by using songs, students can get new and familiar vocabulary that is listened to motivate students. An interesting song will certainly foster students' interest in learning vocabulary in the lyrics (Dilago, et al., 2022).

Engaging learning with music and singing is highly recommended by language teaching guidelines (Baills, 2021). Learning to use songs can create memories that are not easily forgotten because listening to songs will provide a good reflection for students. Good reflections provide attraction and pleasure that others can enjoy. So, using songs is a good medium for learning English in improving students' listening skills. Learning to use songs can create memories that are not easily forgotten because listening to songs will provide a good reflection for students. Good reflections provide attraction and pleasure that others can enjoy. In addition, songs can create a comfortable classroom atmosphere, provide positive energy, improve strong memory and stimulate students because it can reduce stress and anxiety (Supeno, 2018).

Melisa, et al. (2022) in their research retrace the use of English learning on the effectiveness obtained. Her research focuses more on the use of songs that provide effectiveness to students as well as comments from teachers about learning to listen to songs. In addition, Ferlazzo & Sypniewski (2018) provide some strategies to develop students' listening skills in learning English. Focusing on understanding the meaning of listening to English songs has a communicative purpose related to the accuracy of learning to listen. Informal language research on songs that can be learned through the ability to listen to foreign languages is English (Ludke, 2019). Based on the explanation of the qualitative literature review, it can be concluded that songs can have a positive effect on students.

Meta-analysis is a medium that aims to obtain and synthesize the results of primary qualitative research. In addition, it is able to increase a broader understanding of the theory, catalog research results, develop actions, conduct a comprehensive evaluation of research creating methods and methodologies in a particular field (Levitt, 2018). In addition, To obtain relevant information, the factor that must be considered is the total research for synthetics of about ten studies in order to obtain a definite result. Conversely, if it does not get a clear result, then the problem is known from factors depending on the case (Lorenc, Felix, Petticrew, Torres, Thomas, Thomas, Eves, Richardson, 2016). In meta-analysis researchers collect the same data then compare the most relevant ones for analysis. The selection of these data will determine the further process of the research carried out (Akojie, et al., 2019)

From the statement above, this article is different from those previous studies.. By giving limitations of the methodology, the present study aims to provide a rigorous systematic review and meta-analysis of the available evidence for the effectiveness of using a song as a medium to teach English vocabulary. To our knowledge, there has been no published quantitative synthesis of the literature specifically focused on the efficacy of using a song as a medium to improve students' vocabulary mastery. Therefore, to explore further, the purpose of this researcher is to answer the research questions by proving that songs as a tool can improve

vocabulary mastery. Researchers used the meta-analysis method to prove that songs are suitable for use as a medium for learning English.

Method

In this method, the author conducts the systematic review and meta-analysis using the website DIMENSION recommendations (Preferred Linked research data from idea to impact: Dimension data and solutions for discovery and analytics. The type of publication is article OR proceeding. The source title of articles was taken in PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education) OR IJEE (Indonesian Journal of English Education) OR English Language Teaching. The keywords of the title and abstract are English songs and vocabulary. It is described in table 1

Table I DIMENSION search term	
Type of Publication	(Article* OR Proceeding*)
Source of Title Article	("PROJECT" OR "IJEE" OR "English Language Teaching")
Title and Abstract	("*English song*" OR "*Vocabulary*")

Search Strategy

Initially, on July 2, 2022, a systematic search was performed by searching using the keywords 'English song, Vocabulary'. In this search, I found complete data from 270,000 publications by focusing on searching for Text in the title and abstract. The data is the result of publications from all over the world. Meanwhile, in this study, the analysis was carried out in more depth by filtering the search based on several criteria, including articles selected based on the past 5 years, then in Research Categories the author also chooses several criteria, followed by a filtering process based on the Publication Type namely Article and Proceeding. A final search was conducted on September 19, 2022, and finally filtering there are 4 categories selected in the Source Title section. Until this final stage, the total of all articles that have been filtered based on the criteria above has reached 10 articles. Therefore, the authors read and assessed the feasibility of 10 articles selected based on the appropriate focus of this material, 4 articles were taken for further analysis.

Criteria Screening

In particular, the following Criteria were determined to ensure the relevance and quality of the selected publications.

- 1) Published publications must be in accordance with the chosen topic.
- 2) Published publications must contain the use of songs in learning English to improve Vocabulary

3) Article publications are taken the most recent, 5 years back

4) Article published with the theme must not be out of the topic

Coding Articles

After screening the articles based on the criteria, the author did coding data. The following is the result of the coding data according to the title of the articles, participant, and method of the research.

Coding	Title of Journal	Participants	Method of the research
Coding I	Improving students' vocabulary mastery through listening song	Junior high school (n=29)	classroom action research
Coding II	Increasing Kindergarten Students' Vocabulary and Learning Interest Through English Kids Songs at Palembang Paramount School	Pre-elementary school students (n=9)	Classroom action research
Coding III	Increasing Vocabulary Mastery by Using Song Related Reading Texts to Children Aged Six to Twelve	Elementary school (n=25)	Experiment research
Coding IV	Using song to improve vocabulary mastery for elementary school	Elementary school (n= 30)	Experiment research

Result

Sample Analysis

From 10 articles on a song as a medium of English teaching, there are only 4 articles that discuss increasing students' vocabulary mastery by using a song quantitatively. 2 articles use classroom action research and 2 articles use experiment research. The sample sizes varied from N = 9 to N = 30. The participants were pre-elementary students (9.7%), elementary students (59.14%), and junior-high students (31.18%). The language of the instructional material was English (100%).

Firstly, the researcher presented a narrative synthesis of all included studies in the systematic review followed by the meta-analysis of sufficient data. An overview of the overall using song as a medium of vocabulary English teaching can be described as follows:

1. Improving Students' Vocabulary Mastery Through Listening Song (Coding I)

This researcher used action research from the results of the pretest and posttest of the use of songs which can improve students' vocabulary. This can be seen from the following table:

AVERAGE SCORE		
NO	Pretest	Post Test
1.	52.0	71.3
2.	62.7	83.4
3.	58.6	91.4

On the results of this pretest and posttest, researchers performed three times with different results. In the first pretest it was 52.0 with a posttest of 71.3. While the second pretest was 62.7 with a posttest of 83.4, and the third result was 58.6 with a posttest of 91.4. This shows that posttests can have improved results than pretest results.

NO		Total Score
1.	Pretest	5080
2.	Posttest	7200
Total		12280

The pretest and posttest results showed an increase in posttest results with a total pretest value of 5080 and posttest 7200. It can be categorized that songs provide positive value for vocabulary improvement.

2 Increasing Kindergarten Students' Vocabulary And Learning Interest Through English Kids Songs At Palembang Paramount School (Coding II)

In the results of coding III, researchers used the Classroom Action Research method by making observations on students using pretests and posttests. It can be seen as follows:

Observation	Pretest	Post Test
Teaching and learning process	62,2	88,25
Student assessment	54,15	86,1
Mean	58,35	87,18

In the results of observations, researchers look at the teaching and learning process and student assessment. This can be shown in the pretests and posttest performed. In the results of the first pretest in the teaching and learning process with a pretest of 62.2 and a post test of 88.25. Meanwhile, from the assessment of pretest students 54.15 and posttest 86.1. The final mean of the pretest was 58.35 and the post-test was 87.18. This can be seen in a

significant increase in posttesting in students who experienced an increase in achievement and mastery of vocabulary using song tools.

3. Increasing Vocabulary Mastery By Using Song Related Reading Texts To Children Aged Six To Twelve (Coding III)

In this study, researchers used the quantitative method, because this study is experimental research. The data used was obtained from the results of student pretests and posttests. The results of the pretest and posttest can be shown below:

	Total	Mean
Pretest	1490	59,6
Post tes	2158,75	86,35

The data above shows the total achievement score of children in the 1490 pretest with a mean score of 59.6 which has a standard ability to adjust vocabulary in students. While the posttest score was 2158.75 with a mean of 86.35 which had a significant increase in vocabulary mastery in students. The results of the posttest showed that the linkage of songs can improve students' vocabulary in children aged six to twelve years.

4. Using Song To Improve Vocabulary Mastery For Elementary School (Coding IV)

In this study, researchers used the pre-experimental method by using the results of the pretest and posttest. The results of the improvement are seen from the results of the pretest and post test, the results are described in the form of the following table:

	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	SD
Pre test	30	80	54,60	13,642
Post test	70	100	81,07	7,852

In the use of pretests and posttests conducted on elementary school students, it shows that in the pretest there are minimum scores of 30 and a maximum of 80. In addition, the results on the posttest show a minimum value of 70 and a maximum of 100. The average value on the pretest was 54.60 and the posttest was 81.07 with a standard deviation of the pretest of 13.642 and the post test of 7.852. From the results of the pretest and posttest, it can be concluded that the posttest results have increased in children. This means that the use of songs used in elementary school students is effectively carried out to improve vocabulary mastery in students.

Discussion

The discussion of this research is, using songs to improve Students' Vocabulary Mastery. The finding this research is on Coding which has been stated in the article Coding (1) the use of

songs used in elementary school students is effectively carried out to improve vocabulary mastery in students. This can be seen from the table which states that there was an increase in the Post test with an average of 81.07 which previously carried out the Pre-test with an average of 54.60. in coding (2) The results state that the use of songs can give a positive value in increasing Vocabulary, this is stated in the use of 3 pre-test and post-test at different times. The first pre-test results were 52.0, the second 62.7, the third 58.6 while the number of Post-tests in 3 tests was 71.3 for the first test, 83.4 for the second test, 91.4 post-test results were 3, this shows that there is an increase in each test carried out. Coding (3) also gives test results that there is an increase in achievement and an increase in Vocabulary Mastery using songs as a learning tool, the researchers here make observations using Pre-test and Post-test as material for student tests in using songs as a learning tool to improve students' Vocabulary or not. Coding (4) states that songs can improve Vocabulary Mastery for children aged 6 to 9 years. This is proven by the results of the pre-test and post-test conducted by researchers using the quantitative method with a total of 1490 pre-test results with an average of 59.6 and post-test results of 2158.75 with an average of 86.35. Very high post test results indicate that there is significant progress between the pre test and post test. Thus it can be said that the use of songs can improve Vocabulary Mastery

Coding	Title of Journal	Mean Pre-test	Mean Post test	%
Coding I	Improving students' vocabulary mastery through listening song	58,6	91,4	21,86
Coding II	Increasing Kindergarten Students' Vocabulary and Learning Interest Through English Kids Songs at Palembang Paramount School	58,35	87,18	19,81
Coding III	Increasing Vocabulary Mastery by Using Song Related Reading Texts to Children Aged Six to Twelve	59,6	86,35	18,33
Coding IV	Using song to improve vocabulary mastery for elementary school	54,60	81,07	19,51
	Mean	57,79	86,5	19,90

Benefits of Song as a learning medium

The use of songs for language learning media in the method of developing listening skills has a good effect. First, during the English learning process in the classroom, they are involved and play an active role. In addition, it can also improve their memory, making it easy to concentrate. When they understand, learning English will be more fun and relieve stress. The use of songs played together in the classroom also has a positive effect because it can increase the sense of community of a comfortable group. It is also undeniable that songs can improve students' mood because of one of the effective teaching techniques for learning

pronunciation as well as other abilities. This is what makes interesting songs used in learning English.

Songs are one of the important aspects that can develop a level of sensitivity through sound. In addition, songs can increase student appeal and morale. Listening to songs also has positive benefits, such as slowing blood pressure, riley, as well as reducing muscle tension, so as to create a calm and comfortable atmosphere. Not only that, songs can increase imagination related to improving the child's intelligence. Such intelligence affects the good memory of the lyrics of fun songs.

Listening to songs in learning English can improve their abilities, including adding new vocabulary, developing their pronunciation, and improving listening skills. The more accustomed to listening, the more commonly used the vocabulary obtained will be understood. In addition, the development of pronunciation can be mastered because it is practiced in the correct pronunciation by native English-speaking singers. This is what provides good benefits in improving their skills.

The influence of songs for students in learning can reduce tension and calmness. This calmness can be seen from the song that is effective in the role of learning. Choosing a good song according to gender and age can influence the selection of song styles such as, jazz, pop, rap, and others. The selection then has an effect on students' listening ability to hone their English skills. Song sources obtained from various kinds of content, such as blogs, podcasts, movies, and others.

The use of songs in learning is beneficial for students to motivate in learning. because it is an activity that is felt to be fun, such as instrumental music that provides tranquility, examples of classical music or the like that are chosen by students to feel positive, with a relaxed style. Songs contain original language, are easy to get and provide vocabulary, culture and language that make students feel happy. Music can strengthen students' spiritual sense and help them maintain a balance in their lives. through music one can convey their thoughts and exert control over their emotions through music as a tool.

Thus the use of songs in the learning process is a fun thing for students. In general, for young people, songs serve as a recreation rather than a way of communicating messages. The song makes them have a sense of satisfaction, a feeling of happiness that will make them try even harder in learning. With the use of songs, listening skills can also be improved through this practice.

Conclusion

Improving vocabulary to student is very important because learning English requires a lot of vocabulary so that student can master the language they are learning. Songs can be used in Learning English vocabulary to support teachers in teaching and improving vocabulary. In addition, it can create a good reflection for students. The researcher analyzed from coding I, coding II, coding III and coding IV which stated that overall there was a significant difference between pre-test and post-test scores, which were taken before treatment or before children were taught to use song as tool learning English. The post-test was given after being taught using songs. The difference betwee from the results of the pretest and post-test coding I was

21.86%, coding II was 19.81%, coding III was 18.33%, and coding IV was 19.51%. From the total of all coding showed 57.79% pretest, 86.5% post-test and the number of pretest and post-test all coding was 19.90%. This means that there is a significant difference between the pre-test and post-test scores. Based on the results of the questionnaire, this study shows the effectiveness of the goal of increasing vocabulary mastery using songs. The tabulation steps of the questionnaire show that it is good to improve vocabulary mastery using song, which proves that song as tool is an effective way to improve children's vocabulary mastery.

References

- Akojie, Patricia, Fern Entrekin, Debra Bacon, and Therese Kanai. (June 4, 2019). "Qualitative Meta-Data Analysis: Perceptions and Experiences of Online Doctoral Students." *American Journal of Qualitative Research* 3, no. 1. <https://doi.org/10.29333/ajqr/5814>.
- Bai, Zhihong. (July 1, 2018). "An Analysis of English Vocabulary Learning Strategies." *Journal of Language Teaching and Research* 9, no. 4 : 849. <https://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0904.24>.
- Baills, Florence, Yuan Zhang, Yuhui Cheng, Yuran Bu, and Pilar Prieto. (June 2021). "Listening to Songs and Singing Benefitted Initial Stages of Second Language Pronunciation but Not Recall of Word Meaning." *Language Learning* 71, no. 2, 369–413. <https://doi.org/10.1111/lang.12442>.
- Bawawa, Marni. (July 10, 2020). "Teaching English Vocabulary Using Songs To Developing Students' Vocabulary Mastery." *Kajian Linguistik* 8, No. 1. <https://doi.org/10.35796/kaling.8.1.2020.29099>.
- Dilago, S., Liando, N., & Kukus, F. (2022). Students' Perceptions Of Using Song Lyrics As A Media To Improve Vocabulary Mastery. *JoTELL Journal of Teaching English, Linguistics, and Literature*, 1 No 5, 639–652. <https://doi.org/10.36582/jotell.v1i5.4081>
- Fridayanti, Arie, Tahrun, and Mulyadi. (2021). "Increasing Kindergarten Students' Vocabulary and Learning Interest Through English Kids Songs at Palembang Paramount School:" Palembang, Indonesia. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210716.128>.
- Mantika, L. (2021). Improving the Students' Vocabulary Mastery Using Songs. *English Education Journal*, 10, No 1, 25–37. <https://doi.org/10.20961/ee.v10i1.39570>
- Levitt, Heidi M. (May 4, 2018). "How to Conduct a Qualitative Meta-Analysis: Tailoring Methods to Enhance Methodological Integrity." *Psychotherapy Research* 28, no. 3, 367–78. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10503307.2018.1447708>.
- Ferlazzo, Sypnieski. (2018). "Listening." In *The ELL Teacher's Toolbox*, 311–19. San Francisco: John Wiley & Sons, Inc. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781119428701.ch31>.
- Lorenc, Theo, Lambert Felix, Mark Petticrew, G J Melendez-Torres, James Thomas, Sian Thomas, Alison O'Mara-Eves, and Michelle Richardson. (December 2016). "Meta-Analysis, Complexity, and Heterogeneity: A Qualitative Interview Study of Researchers' Methodological Values and Practices." *Systematic Reviews* 5, no. 1, 192. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13643-016-0366-6>.

- Ludke, Karen M. (2019). "Songs and Music." In *The Handbook of Informal Language Learning*, edited by Mark Dressman and Randall William Sadler, 1st ed., 203–13. Wiley. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781119472384.ch13>.
- Melisa, Melisa, Tgk Maya Silviyanti, and Arifin Syamaun. (April 30, 2022). "Using Songs to Promote the Affective Domain in Learning Listening of EFL Students." *Englisia: Journal of Language, Education, and Humanities* 9, no. 2, 91. <https://doi.org/10.22373/ej.v9i2.11225>.
- Ramadani, Amelia, and Siti Halimah. (January 25, 2019). "Using Song To Improve Vocabulary Mastery For Elementary School." *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education)* 2, no. 1, 52. <https://doi.org/10.22460/project.v2i1.p52-57>.
- Sari, Intan Permata, Elva Elvinna Asahra, and Yana Yana. (May 21, 2019). "Improving Students' Vocabulary Mastery Using English Song." *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education)* 2, no. 3, 410. <https://doi.org/10.22460/project.v2i3.p410-415>.
- Setiawan, Cecep. (May 11, 2019). "IMPROVING STUDENTS' VOCABULARY MASTERY THROUGH LISTENING SONG." *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education)* 2, no. 3, 392. <https://doi.org/10.22460/project.v2i3.p392-397>.
- Solihat, Dadang, and Prita Lusiana Utami. (2014). "IMPROVING STUDENTS' LISTENING SKILL" 3, no. 1, 10.
- Wahyudi, W, Kamaludin Yusra, and A Amrullah. (2021). "Increasing Vocabulary Mastery by Using Song-Related Reading Texts to Children Aged Six to Twelve:" *Mataram, Indonesia*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210525.087>.